

Bowen Greenwood
CLERK OF THE SUPREME COURT
STATE OF MONTANA

Case Number: AC 17-0694

Mark M. Kovacich
Ben A. Snipes
Ross T. Johnson
KOVACICH SNIPES JOHNSON, P.C.
P.O. Box 2325
Great Falls, MT 59403
(406) 761-5595
(406) 761-5805 - fax
mark@mttriallawyers.com
ben@mttriallawyers.com
ross@mttriallawyers.com

Attorneys for KSJ Plaintiffs

# IN THE ASBESTOS CLAIMS COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA Cause No. AC 17-0694

IN RE ASBESTOS LITIGATION,

Consolidated Cases.

# KSJ PLAINTIFFS' JOINDER IN MHSL'S RESPONSE BRIEFS

(Applicable to All Cases)

COMES NOW the KSJ Plaintiffs, by and through counsel of record and hereby joins and adopts by reference the briefs set forth by MHSL in response to Defendant BNSF's Motion for Show Cause and Motion to Dismiss 103 Personal Representative Claims. While these motions are aimed at the MHSL Plaintiffs, the issues addressed therein collaterally impact the ongoing deferred docket status and obligations of the

KSJ Plaintiffs. By this pleading, KSJ Plaintiffs further provide the following information, not inconsistent with the positions asserted by MHSL:

### **Annual Medical Exams and Serial Radiology**

Libby, Montana, claimants continue to face logistical and practical challenges for local compliance with the annual medical exam deferred docket management provision. As discussed with the Court during the October 13, 2018, hearing, most clients do not get acquire (and do not medically necessitate) annual radiology surveillance. See Transcript (10/31/18), 14:16-15:1.

To address this reality, KSJ has approached certain Defendants with tolling agreements dismissing unimpaired claims, without prejudice, while tolling the statute of limitations to allow settlement or litigation when impairment arises. See Manual for Complex Litigation, Fourth, § 13.23, p. 179. KSJ counsel remains amenable to such agreements with Defendants individually and/or globally by Order of the Asbestos Claims Court (i.e. MHSL's Motion for Registry).

# **Costs of Acquiring Medical Records**

BNSF takes the position that the Plaintiffs must bear fully the costs of providing the Defendants with the annual medical exam records. This is inconsistent with this Court's Order on Cost Sharing (August 30, 2018), establishing a repository for such records and a cost sharing platform for all involved parties. To date, KSJ Plaintiffs' minority share of record repository acquisition costs exceeds \$11,000. To

then add the complete burden for Plaintiffs to pay all acquisition costs for annual medical records is inequitable and contrary to the cost sharing Order. The repository was set up for the express purpose of records collection and should be used for the acquisition of annual medical reports.

#### Warboys impact on the reliability of CARD findings

Wholesale exclusion of CARD medical evidence is not supported by the Montana Workers' Compensation Court's (WCC) findings in *Warboys v. Liberty Northwest Ins. Corp.*, 2020 MTWCC 5. *Warboys* was largely a factual dispute regarding the competing medical findings of treating and consulting physicians. Warboys' occupational disease claim was supported by CARD providers, a consulting pulmonologist, and a local radiologist. The Court admitted CARD's findings, along with other medical findings, and afforded them the weight it deemed appropriate.

BNSF's assertion that "no other radiologist... detected any signs of asbestos related disease in the patient" is a flat misrepresentation. BNSF Show Cause Brief, p. 18. In addition to the CARD findings, Kalispell radiologist, Dr. Patrick McDonnell, noted Warboys' January 17, 2013, CT scan revealed:

SLIGHT SMOOTH PLEURAL THICKENING OF THE MID AND LOWER HEMITHORACES BILATERALLY SUPERIMPOSED UPON OTHERWISE NORMAL PROMINENCE OF PLEURAL FAT. THE FINDINGS ARE NONSPECIFIC THOUGH COULD CONCEIVABLY REFLECT ASBESTOS RELATED DISEASE.

1/18/13 St. John's Lutheran Hospital Radiology Report, attached as Exhibit A;

*Warboys*,  $\P$  15.

After hearing and admitting the competing medical evidence, the Court found

that Warboys did not have a "currently diagnosable ARD," but rather "nonspecific,

equivocal pleural prominence." Warboys, ¶¶ 49, 54. Recognizing the "latency period

of ARDs and the difficulty of diagnosing an ARD at its earliest stages, Warboys may

develop a diagnosable ARD in the future," leaving the door open for a future

occupational disease claim. Warboys, ¶ 54.

Warboys does not serve to diminish the credibility of the CARD providers.

Instead, it illuminates the persistent issue recognized by all parties and this Court.

Early ARD medical findings, without substantial impairment, necessitate early filings

to preserve the applicable statue of limitations. Such premature, forced litigation is

a burden on the courts, expensive for all parties, and (like *Warboys*) may not provide

finality to the claims/causes at issue.

DATED this 15th day of May, 2020.

KOVACICH SNIPES JOHNSON, P.C.

By: /s/ Ben A. Snipes

Ben Snipes P.O. Box 2325

Great Falls, MT 59403

Attorneys for KSJ Plaintiffs

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Ben A. Snipes, hereby certify that I have served true and accurate copies of the foregoing Response/Objection - Other to the following on 05-15-2020:

Amy Poehling Eddy (Attorney) 920 South Main Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Amy Eddy Service Method: eService

Roger M. Sullivan (Attorney) 345 1st Avenue E MT Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: eService

Allan M. McGarvey (Attorney) 345 1st Avenue East Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: eService

John F. Lacey (Attorney) 345 1st Avenue East Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: eService

Ethan Aubrey Welder (Attorney) 345 1st Avenue East Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: eService

Dustin Alan Richard Leftridge (Attorney) 345 First Avenue East Montana Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: eService

Jeffrey R. Kuchel (Attorney)

305 South 4th Street East

Suite 100

Missoula MT 59801

Representing: Accel Performance Group LLC, et al, MW Customs Papers, LLC

Service Method: eService

Danielle A.R. Coffman (Attorney)

1667 Whitefish Stage Rd

Kalispell MT 59901

Representing: Accel Performance Group LLC, et al, MW Customs Papers, LLC

Service Method: eService

Gary M. Zadick (Attorney)

P.O. Box 1746

#2 Railroad Square, Suite B

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Honeywell International

Service Method: eService

Gerry P. Fagan (Attorney)

27 North 27th Street, Suite 1900

P O Box 2559

Billings MT 59103-2559

Representing: CNH Industrial America LLC

Service Method: eService

G. Patrick HagEstad (Attorney)

2419 Mullan Road

Suite B

Missoula MT 59808

Representing: United Conveyor Corporation, Riley Stoker Corporation et al

Service Method: eService

Jennifer Marie Studebaker (Attorney)

210 East Capitol Street

**Suite 2200** 

Jackson MS 39201

Representing: Goulds Pump LLC, Grinnell Corporation, ITT LLC, et al

Service Method: eService

Joshua Alexander Leggett (Attorney)

210 East Capitol Street, Suite 2200

Jackson MS 39201-2375

Representing: Goulds Pump LLC, Grinnell Corporation, ITT LLC, et al

Service Method: eService

Vernon M. McFarland (Attorney)

200 South Lamar Street, Suite 100

Jackson MS 39201-4099

Representing: Goulds Pump LLC, Grinnell Corporation, ITT LLC, et al

Service Method: eService

Jean Elizabeth Faure (Attorney)

P.O. Box 2466

1314 Central Avenue

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Goulds Pump LLC, Grinnell Corporation, Borg Warner Morse Tec LLC

Service Method: eService

Jason Trinity Holden (Attorney)

1314 CENTRAL AVE

P.O. BOX 2466

Montana

**GREAT FALLS MT 59403** 

Representing: Goulds Pump LLC, Grinnell Corporation, Borg Warner Morse Tec LLC

Service Method: eService

Chad E. Adams (Attorney)

PO Box 1697

Helena MT 59624

Representing: Weir Valves & Controls USA, Cyprus Amex Minerals Company, Fischbach and Moore, Inc. et al, American Honda Motor Co., Inc., Harder Mechanical Contractors, Nissan North American Inc.

Service Method: eService

Katie Rose Ranta (Attorney)

Faure Holden, Attorneys at Law, P.C.

1314 Central Avenue

P.O. Box 2466

**GREAT FALLS MT 59403** 

Representing: Borg Warner Morse Tec LLC

Service Method: eService

Stephen Dolan Bell (Attorney)

Dorsey & Whitney LLP

125 Bank Street

Suite 600

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: Ford Motor Company

Service Method: eService

Dan R. Larsen (Attorney)

Dorsey & Whitney LLP

111 South Main

**Suite 2100** 

Salt Lake City UT 84111

Representing: Ford Motor Company

Service Method: eService

Kelly Gallinger (Attorney)

315 North 24th Street

Billings MT 59101

Representing: Maryland Casualty Corporation

Service Method: eService

Robert J. Phillips (Attorney)

Garlington, Lohn & Robinson, PLLP

P.O. Box 7909

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Emma Laughlin Mediak (Attorney)

Garlington, Lohn & Robinson, PLLP

P.O. Box 7909

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Daniel Jordan Auerbach (Attorney)

201 West Railroad St., Suite 300

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: Weir Valves & Controls USA, Cyprus Amex Minerals Company

Service Method: eService

Leo Sean Ward (Attorney)

PO Box 1697

Helena MT 59624

Representing: Weir Valves & Controls USA, Cyprus Amex Minerals Company, Fischbach and Moore, Inc. et al, American Honda Motor Co., Inc., Harder Mechanical Contractors, Nissan North American

Inc.

Service Method: eService

Robert B. Pfennigs (Attorney)

P.O. Box 2269

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Stimson Lumber Company, Zurn Industries, Inc., Mazda Motor of America, Inc.

Service Method: eService

Rick A. Regh (Attorney)

P.O. Box 2269

**GREAT FALLS MT 59403** 

Representing: Stimson Lumber Company, Zurn Industries, Inc., Mazda Motor of America, Inc.

Service Method: eService

Mark Trevor Wilson (Attorney)

300 Central Ave.

7th Floor

P.O. Box 2269

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Stimson Lumber Company, Zurn Industries, Inc., Mazda Motor of America, Inc.

Service Method: eService

Robert M. Murdo (Attorney)

203 N orth Ewing

Helena MT 59601

Representing: Mine Safety Appliance Company LLC

Service Method: eService

Murry Warhank (Attorney)

203 North Ewing Street

Helena MT 59601

Representing: Mine Safety Appliance Company LLC

Service Method: eService

Mark M. Kovacich (Attorney)

Kovacich Snipes Johnson, PC

P.O. Box 2325

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Backen et al, Sue Kukus, et al

Service Method: eService

Ross Thomas Johnson (Attorney)

P.O. Box 2325

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Backen et al, Sue Kukus, et al

Service Method: eService

Randy J. Cox (Attorney)

P. O. Box 9199

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: A.W. Chesterson Company

Service Method: eService

Zachary Aaron Franz (Attorney)

201 W. Main St.

Suite 300

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: A.W. Chesterson Company

Service Method: eService

Robert J. Sullivan (Attorney)

PO Box 9199

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: Ingersoll-Rand, Co.

Service Method: eService

Dale R. Cockrell (Attorney)

145 Commons Loop, Suite 200

P.O. Box 7370

Kalispell MT 59904

Representing: State of Montana

Service Method: eService

Martin S. King (Attorney)

321 West Broadway, Suite 300

P.O. Box 4747

Missoula MT 59806

Representing: Foster Wheeler Energy Services, Inc.

Service Method: eService

Maxon R. Davis (Attorney)

P.O. Box 2103

Great Falls MT 59403

Representing: Continental Casualty Company

Service Method: eService

Tom L. Lewis (Attorney)

2715 Park Garden Lane

Great Falls MT 59404

Representing: Harold N. Samples

Service Method: eService

Keith Edward Ekstrom (Attorney)

601 Carlson Parkway #995

Minnetonka MN 55305

Representing: Brent Wetsch

Service Method: eService

William Rossbach (Attorney)

401 N. Washington

P. O. Box 8988

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: Michael Letasky

Service Method: eService

Kennedy C. Ramos (Attorney)

1717 Pennsylvania Avenue NW

1200

wash DC 20006

Representing: Maryland Casualty Corporation

Service Method: eService

Edward J. Longosz (Attorney) 1717 Pennsylvania Avenue NW

**Suite 1200** 

Washington DC 20006

Representing: Maryland Casualty Corporation

Service Method: eService

Chad M. Knight (Attorney)

929 Pearl Street

Ste. 350

Boulder CO 80302

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Anthony Michael Nicastro (Attorney)

27 Shiloh Road, Ste 10

Billings MT 59106

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Nadia Hafeez Patrick (Attorney)

929 Pearl Street Suite 350

Boulder CO 80302

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Kevin A. Twidwell (Attorney)

1911 South Higgins Ave

PO Box 9312

Missoula MT 59807

Representing: Libby School District #4

Service Method: eService

Jinnifer Jeresek Mariman (Attorney)

345 First Avenue East

Kalispell MT 59901

Representing: Adams, et al

Service Method: eService

James E. Roberts (Attorney)

283 West Front Street

Suite 203

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

William Adam Duerk (Attorney)

283 West Front Street

Suite 203

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: BNSF Railway Company

Service Method: eService

Daniel W. Hileman (Attorney) 22 Second Ave. W., Suite 4000

Kalispell MT 59901

Representing: Maryland Casualty Corporation

Service Method: eService

Nathan Andrew Huey (Attorney)

201 West Main Street

Suite 101

Missoula MT 59802

Representing: Robinson Insulation Company

Service Method: eService

Mark S. Williams (Attorney)

235 East Pine

PO BOX 9440

Missoula MT 59807-9440

Representing: Ace Fire Underwriters Companyh

Service Method: eService

Michael Crill (Other)

PO Box 145

Rimrock AZ 86335

Service Method: Conventional

Tammy Peterson (Interested Observer)

Asbestos Court Clerk

Helena MT 59601

Service Method: Conventional

Matthew Cuffe (Other)

512 California

Libby MT 59923

Service Method: Conventional

Mike McMahon (Other)

227 Broadway, Second Floor

Helena MT 59601

Service Method: Conventional

Jon A. Oldenburg (Other)

P.O. Box 1124

Lewistown MT 59457

Service Method: Conventional

John W. Parker (Other) Cascade County Courthouse 325 2nd Avenue North Great Falls MT 59401 Service Method: Conventional

Greg Pinski (Other) 415 2nd Ave N Great Falls MT 59401 Service Method: Conventional

Dan Wilson (Other)
Flathead County District Court
920 South, Main, Suite 210
Kalispell MT 59901
Service Method: Conventional

Jon L. Heberling (Attorney) 345 First Avenue East Kalispell MT 59901 Representing: Adams, et al Service Method: Conventional

Michael D. Plachy (Attorney) 1200 17th Street Denver CO 80202 Representing: Honeywell International Service Method: Conventional

Charles J. Seifert (Attorney) 50 S. Last Chance Gulch 3rd Fl. P.O. Box 598

Helena MT 59624

Representing: Ford Motor Company, Maryland Casualty Corporation

Service Method: Conventional

Fredric A. Bremseth (Attorney) 601 Carlson Parkway, Suite 995 Minnetonka MN 55305-5232 Representing: Brent Wetsch Service Method: Conventional

Mark A. Johnston (Attorney) 1717 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, 12th Floor Washington DC 20006 Representing: Maryland Casualty Corporation Service Method: Conventional Walter G. Watkins (Attorney) 210 E. Capitol Street, Ste. 2200 Jackson MS 39201 Representing: International Paper Co. Service Method: Conventional

Nancy M. Erfle (Attorney) Gordon Rees LLP 121 SW Morrison St., Suite 1575 Portland OR 97204 Representing: Robinson Insulation Company Service Method: Conventional

Electronically signed by Dawnell Komac on behalf of Ben A. Snipes Dated: 05-15-2020